

Historic Preservation Commission

October 5, 2009 Minutes

Meeting called to order at 7:35 pm.

Roll Call

Present

Barbara Shanley  
Tony Bourgholtzer  
Yvonne Beatrice, (late 7:45pm)  
Carol Greene, (late, 8:00pm)  
Deborah Grob  
Gus Vasiliadis

Absent

Marthajean Drago  
Randell Brewster, excused  
John Bristow, excused  
Alex Micheline, excused

The secretary read the Sunshine Law.

**Flag Salute**

The Chair explained to the public that the Commission does not have a quorum until either Mrs. Beatrice or Mrs. Greene is present.

Mr. Ed Goodell introduced himself as the director of the New York/New Jersey Trail Conference (NYNJTC).

At this time, 7:45 pm, Mrs. Beatrice arrived and the meeting was officially opened.

**Public Session:** Mrs. Grob moved to open the Public Session and Mrs. Bourgholtzer seconded the motion. All approved.

Vote: 5 yes; 0 no. Grob, yes; Beatrice, yes; Bourgholtzer, yes; Vasiliadis, yes; Shanley, yes.

Mr. Goodell:

The Chair recognized, Mr. Edward Goodell, 156 Ramapo Valley Road, Mahwah, NJ. Mr. Goodell introduced himself to the Commission as the director of the NYNJTC, and reported that he is here to informally meet with the Commission regarding the Darlington Schoolhouse renovation/restoration project. Mr. Goodell stated that the NYNJTC has been working on this project for the past four years. Mr. Goodell gave a slide presentation of the existing exterior and interior of the building. He explained that the architect will be submitting the formal renovation/restoration set of plans to the Construction Code Official. At that time, he will ask to officially meet with the Commission.

Mr. Goodell stated that the NYNJTC was formed in 1920, when the Palisades Interstate Park went to the different hiking clubs and asked for their help in creating a system of marked trails in the parks. The NYNJTC maintains 1700 miles of marked trails, and is staffed by volunteers. The NYNJTC was based in Manhattan, NY, until 2001 when it moved to Mahwah, at the old union hall on Ramapo Valley Road. The NYNJTC choose Mahwah because it is at the center of the trail network, which stretches from the

Delaware Water Gap up to the Catskills and to the Massachusetts border and includes the five boroughs of New York and twenty counties. It was suggested to the NYNJTC that the vacant Darlington Schoolhouse would be a perfect fit for the NYNJTC offices. Through Green Acres Fund grant money the NYNJTC bought the building and the property is now park land. The NYNJTC is a tenant in common with the Township of Mahwah. The NYNJTC has exclusive use of the building for as long as the NYNJTC abides by the conservation and historic easement. Which means only a conservation organization can inhabit this building as an office, which is the plan of the NYNJTC. They only reason the NYNJTC Trustees agreed to buy this building was if it could be used for its offices and an educational center.

The NYNJTC received a grant to do a preservation plan and a historic nomination. The building is on the National Historic Register and the NYNJTC is pursuing additional funding for the restoration. At present the NYNJTC is in receipt of \$800,000 from the New Jersey Historic Trust Funds and \$200,000 from the Bergen County Preservation Trust. Both grants have to be matched.

The three phase project would be as follows:

1. 1<sup>st</sup> Phase would include exterior stabilization and restoration; estimate cost \$400,000.00
2. 2<sup>nd</sup> Phase is the adaptive reuse of the interior, which they plan to keep the interior walls and surfaces and finishes the same. This completion would allow them to receive a certificate of occupancy and move in. This would not meet the NYNJTC's long term need. Therefore, an addition is needed.
3. 3<sup>rd</sup> Phase is an addition for an educational center.

All three phases are included in the site plan that needs to be approved by the DEP because this property is in the highlands preservation area. It also has wetlands, flood hazards zone and flood way problems as well as stream back encroachment issues that all need to be addressed. The sewer system will be tied into the Township of Mahwah sewer system.

Besides all the permit issues, the big problem is parking. The plans include 24 parking stalls. However, they do not have enough over flow parking for special educational events, which would need close to 150 parking stalls. For the over flow parking, the NYNJTC is proposing to the Mahwah Township Council, at the October 22, 2009 Council meeting, a walkway or pathway to Continental Soldiers Park parking lot.

The Chair interjected that the HPC's concern is the renovation/restoration to the Darlington Schoolhouse.

At this time, Mrs. Greene arrived, 8:00 pm.

Mr. Goodell showed a conceptual drawing of the addition to the building. The addition would extend to the back and will not be seen from the front. Mr. Goodell added this could change depending on the footprint for the Highlands Exception approval. The addition would be the library and educational center. The New Jersey Historic Trust said they would approve the conceptual drawing.

The NYNJTC needs the support of the HPC to help promote this project. The Chair replied that the HPC appreciates Mr. Goodell's presentation and looks forward to the final plans and working with the NJNYTC in completing this project.

Mr. Adriance and Mr. Gaelick:

Let the minutes reflect that Mrs. Greene recused herself from the meeting, because she lives within 200 feet of the Youngs House.

The Chair recognized Mr. Ed Gaelick, 81 Youngs Road, Mahwah and Bergen County Historian associated with the Historic Preservation of Bergen County, Mr. Tim Adriance, 86 E. Main St. Bergen Field, NJ.

Mr. Adriance introduced himself and informed the Commission that he is working with Mr. Gaelick the new owner of the Youngs House, one of Bergen County's historic stone structures. The Youngs House, 81 Youngs Road, original structure on the first floor is a New Jersey Dutch Stone dwelling. The house has gone through numerous changes over the years. The house lost its original roof line and structural determination in the early twentieth century when a second story was added to the rear south end, and wings to the east and west were added, which compromised the original structure of the stone house dwelling. Mr. Adriance stated that looking at the beam structure of the basement the original house seems to have been a one room structure and enlarged to two rooms in the 1830's with a row of eyebrow windows replaced to the south side, which is not visible from the exterior. You need to be across the street to get a good view. Portions of the west wing maybe a 19<sup>th</sup> century structure, it is hard to tell because of the aluminum siding. The windows in that area are a mixture of 1970's modern windows, Anderson casements, and vinyl. The east wing second floor also has vinyl windows. The windows on the original main stone structure of the house have six over six wooden sash windows single glaze with triple track storm windows. The frames of the windows are Stickbill 20<sup>th</sup> century and you can barely see that they were replaced later in the stone work using brick infill, where the original heavy timber frames were removed. In the original New Jersey Dutch stone houses the window frame structure was usually a 4 by 6 or 5 by 6 made with heavy timber which was part of the structural support of the building.

The house is structurally sound. However, the windows are not energy efficient and are in need of replacement. The current triple track storm windows are totally detracting in an architectural sense from the character of the building. Mr. Adriance's suggestion is to take the existing 6 over 6 sashes out of the four south side windows, one on the east and the 20<sup>th</sup> century windows on the north and single 6 over 6 windows on the rear and replace them with new 6 over 6 Weather Shield tilt in windows. The five eyebrow Federal style windows will be replaced with new sashes of thermo pane. Mr. Adriance compared this to the Demarest house project in Ho Ho Kus.

Let the minutes reflect that Mr. Adriance reviewed with the Commission the attributes of the Weather Shield window and that it produces a very high quality window which is also architecturally correct for this Federal style period.

Mrs. Shanley asked if the window replacements for the second floor will meet the Uniform Construction Code for egress windows. Mr. Adriance replied that the Uniform Construction Code for the State of New Jersey requires that when you change the window assembly to a different size or movement then you must conform to the code. If you are replacing like with like and not changing size or dimensions or its form the code does not apply. Therefore, no permit is required for this project. The Department of Community Affairs (DCA) determined that in existing historic structures the entire opening of a tilt in window quantified as the required 5' 7" square feet egress window. With proper instruction, even a child of grade school age could open the window in a case of emergency.

Mr. Adriance also stated that under the Uniform Construction Code Blue Book, there is a Historic Preservation chapter, which allows a Code Construction Official to make a determination that if life safety is not compromised you can vary from the code and issue a variation from the code in the sense of stairways, windows etc. to keep the historic integrity of the structure.

Mrs. Shanley asked when they are planning to order the windows. Mr. Adriance replied as soon as the Commission approves the window replacement proposal.

Mrs. Shanley reported that the Commission usually approves a Construction Permit. However, since no permit is required, and this structure is on the local, County, State and National register because of its New Jersey Dutch stone house designation the HPC will prepare a resolution approving the replacement windows with appropriate New Jersey Dutch stone house style windows as proposed by Mr. Adriance.

The Chair thanked Mr. Gaelick and Mr. Adriance for their presentation and invited them to stay for the HPC's recommendation. Mr. Gaelick and Mr. Adriance thanked the Commission and excused themselves from the meeting.

Mrs. Grob moved to close the Public Session and Mr. Vasiliadis seconded the motion. All approved.

Vote:6 yes; 0 no. Grob, yes; Vasiliadis, yes; Greene, yes; Beatrice, yes; Bourgholtzer, yes, Shanley, yes.

### **New Business**

#### Youngs House:

Let the minutes reflect that after review of the presentation given by Mr. Adriance, Mrs. Grob moved to approve the replacement windows on the Youngs House, 81 Youngs Road, Mahwah, NJ as presented by Mr. Adriance and Mr. Gaelick and include photo documentation of the existing windows prior to replacement and photo documentation of the installed replacement windows which are to be in a glossy print form. Mrs. Beatrice seconded the motion. All approved.

Vote: 5 yes; 0 no. Grob, yes; Vasiliadis, yes; Beatrice, yes; Bourgholtzer, yes, Shanley, yes.

Mrs. Greene, at this time, returned to the HPC meeting.

### **Old Business**

#### Fletcher House

The Chair reported that she had been contacted by Mr. Handley and he told her that Mrs. Handley and her builder have now indicated that they want to replace the windows on the first floor to thermo pane windows. The Fletcher House Sub-Committee, Mrs. Grob, Mr. Vasiliadis and Mrs. Shanley determined that it was not clear if these windows were included on the easement and resolution. The Sub-Committee reviewed the request and agreed that the replacement of the first floor windows could be included in the renovation using the same guidelines as the other replacement windows. However, before that can happen the easement and resolution must be amended. The Chair contact Mr. Handley and informed him that the HPC does not have the funds for additional attorney fees to make these

changes. Mr. Handley will set up an escrow account in the amount of \$1000.00 for any further attorney fees that may be required for the Fletcher House.

Let the minutes reflect that Mrs. Bourgholtzer recused herself, because she lives within 200 feet of the property.

Let the minutes reflect that Mrs. Grob moved to amend section 9C of HPC Resolution #8.3.09(1) **from:**

“In the interior, the two fireplaces and the windows (including the woodwork) will be preserved and restored to the period style. Pursuant to the Plans, one window located at the rear of the original family room will be eliminated and replaced with a door going out to the patio, which French door will be of an arts and crafts style with the appropriate period style hardware”

**To:**

“In the interior, the two fireplaces and the interior woodwork will be preserved and restored to the period style. The original 1909 windows will be replaced with wooden thermal replica windows. Pursuant to the Plans, one window located at the rear of the original family room will be eliminated and replaced with a door going out to the patio, which French door will be of an arts and crafts style with the appropriate period style hardware”

Section 9E(iii) shall be amended **from:**

“Remove the most recently installed Anderson windows and replacing them with arts and crafts style wooden windows”.

**To:**

“Remove the most recently installed Anderson windows and replacing them with arts and crafts style wooden thermal pane windows”

Vote: 5 yes; 0 no. Grob, yes; Vasiliadis, yes; Greene, yes; Beatrice, yes; Shanley, yes.

### **Legal**

The Attorney was not present. The Chair will contact the attorney to amend the easement and Resolution 8.3.09 (1) to reflect the approved changes as Resolution #8.3.09(1a).

Let the minutes reflect that Mrs. Bourgholtzer rejoined the meeting.

### **Minutes**

September 14, 2009 minutes:

Mrs. Grob moved to approve the September 14, 2009 MHPC minutes as read and Mrs. Bourgholtzer seconded the motion. All approved.

Vote: 6 yes; 0 no: Grob, yes; Beatrice, yes; Vasiliadis, yes; Greene, yes; Bourgholtzer, yes; Shanley, yes

### **Chair’s Report**

2008 Historic Marker: Winters Farmhouse. The Chair reported that she has not been able to contact the owner, Mr. Fredericks. The Chair will contact the County Road Department for permission to install the

Winter Farmhouse plaque on the County easement of Ramapo Valley Road. Mrs. Bourgholtzer volunteered to call the owners attorney, Mr. Whitaker, to request the phone number of the owner and follow-up with Mrs. Shanley.

Moffatt Cemetery: The Chair reported that Mrs. Karin LeGreca from the Environmental Commission is organizing a Fall clean-up of the Moffatt Cemetery. The Chair also reported that one of the stones has been damaged and needs to be repaired.

West Mahwah Grant: No report.

81 Youngs Road: No further report.

### **Applications:**

#### Consent Agenda:

Let the minutes reflect that Mrs. Greene moved to approve Development Application, Docket #1293-09, 1000 Mountain Road, and Site Plan Application, Docket 523PF, 83 McKee Drive, Wireless Telecommunications Tower. Mr. Vasiliadis seconded the motion. All approved.

Vote: 6 yes; 0 no: Grob, yes; Vasiliadis, yes; Beatrice, yes; Greene, yes; Bourgholtzer, yes; Shanley, yes.

### **Old Business**

Aronow Stone Cottage: The Chair reported that she had contacted Property Maintenance Inspector, Mr. Thomas Mulvey, and he will take photographs of the cottage. The Chair will request that Mr. Mulvey contact the owner and inform them that they are required to maintain the cottage and repairs need to be made.

Mahwah Day: The Chair reported that she sold \$60.00 of T-shirts and ornaments. She will give the money to the secretary to deposit into the HPC Trust account.

Chair Lifeline, Inc. The Chair and Mr. Vasiliadis will attend the October 21, 2009 Board of Adjustment meeting to present their photos and brief description of the Garrison Mill ruins.

### **New Business**

Historic Awards Program: Mrs. Greene suggested Ramapo College as a candidate in the Preservation and Adaptive Reuse categories for the buildings and grounds of the Birch Estate and Havemeyer Estate.

Mrs. Shanley suggested the Montessory School for the Adaptive Reuse of Commodore Perry School.

Mrs. Greene moved to accept the nominations of Ramapo College and Apple Montessory School as recipients of the HPC Historic Awards Program, and Mrs. Grob seconded the motion. All approved.

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no. Grob, yes, Greene, yes; Beatrice, yes; Vasiliadis, yes; Bourgholtzer, yes; Shanley, yes.

Mr. Vasiliadis volunteered to prepare the presentation for Ramapo College. Mrs. Shanley volunteered to prepare the presentation for the Apple Montessory School.

### **General Discussion**

Mr. Vasiliadis reported that he had attended the Mahwah Museum's exhibit of "Artists of Mahwah Photographs" and spoke with one of the artists Ms. Ruth Ann Hawkins. Ms. Hawkins took photos of the "German House" and the Stag Hill Indian burial site and volunteered to take the Commission members on a tour of the sites. Mrs. Greene reported that she believes that these sites are included in the Bergen County Sites Survey and she will confirm and report her findings at the November HPC meeting.

Mrs. Bourgholtzer moved to adjourn and Mr. Vasiliadis seconded the motion. All approved. Meeting ended at 9:57 pm.

These minutes are a synopsis of the MHPC tapes, which are on file at the Township Municipal Building.

/dms